

XVII.—Hugutio's *Derivationes* and Arnulfus' Commentary on Ovid's *Fasti*¹

JEAN HOLZWORTH

BRYN MAWR COLLEGE

Parallel passages from Arnulfus' commentary on Ovid's *Fasti* and Hugutio's *Derivationes* give evidence of a close relationship between the two works, both of the late twelfth century. It is chronologically impossible that Arnulfus should have used Hugutio. Of the two remaining possibilities, that Hugutio used Arnulfus, or that both used a common source, the latter is best supported by the evidence. This common source might have been either a body of etymological material, now lost or unpublished, or some older commentary on the *Fasti*, such as Arnulfus seems frequently to refer to elsewhere in his commentary.

In 1197 Hugutio Pisanus, teacher of Innocent III and author of the celebrated *Summa in Decretum Gratiani*, was sent by the Pope to the Abbey of Nonantula to keep a watchful eye upon the Abbot's activities.² In the four years that he remained there he composed, "ex libro Papiæ, qui illic est,"³ a book of *Derivationes*. Although the chronicler does not say so, Hugutio used, to an even greater extent than the dictionary of the eleventh-century Papias, the *Derivationes* of his near contemporary, Osbern of Gloucester.⁴ From this he took not only the greater part of his impressive array of citations of the authors, but also the form of his work—arrangement of the derivations, etymologies, and occasional extended discussions under their parent words, alphabetically ordered—inserting from time to time additional glossarial material, much of it biblical. Because the two basic sources are extant, as are also other works used by Hugutio, such as Nonius, Gellius, and Isidore, he has never been thought worthy of a printed edition, but has usually interested only historians of lexicographical method. For them his principal distinction is a passion for "etymologizing" and "deriving" that far outstrips in its fantasies all his creditors. That even this claim

¹ This article represents the expansion and further study of material first brought together in the writer's doctoral dissertation, *An Unpublished Commentary on Ovid's "Fasti" by Arnulfus of Orléans*, Bryn Mawr, 1940 (unpublished).

² G. Goetz, *Corpus Glossariorum Latinorum* (7 vols., Leipzig, 1888-1901) 1.190-196; "Beiträge zur Geschichte der Lateinischen Studien im Mittelalter," *Leipz. Sitzb.* 55 (1903) 121-133; M. Manitius, *Gesch. der Lat. Lit. des Mittelalt.* 3 (Munich, 1931) 191.

³ Muratori, *S. S. rer. Ital.* 9.246A.

⁴ *Locc. cit.* (see note 2).

to originality must be modified is now convincingly demonstrated by the evidence of striking similarities in Arnulfus' commentary on Ovid's *Fasti*.⁵

Any attempt to explain these similarities on the ground that Arnulfus used Hugutio is barred from the outset by what we know of the chronology of Arnulfus' activities. A teacher of the classics at Orléans and author of commentaries on many Ovidian works, Lucan's *Pharsalia*, and possibly Horace's *Satires*, *Epistles*, and *Ars Poetica*,⁶ he was probably at the height of his career about 1175,⁷ for it was at approximately that time that his rival, Matthieu de Vendôme, was forced by their hostilities to move on to Paris⁸—a feud of sufficient notoriety to be mentioned by Eberhard the German.⁹ There is good confirmatory evidence for this date. Several of the manuscripts of Arnulfus' commentaries belong to the end of the twelfth century, and the commentary on Lucan mentions the death of Thomas Becket (1170) and appears to have served as a source for the *Faits des Romains*,¹⁰ dated 1213–1214.¹¹ Finally, and most important, there is the evidence of the *Ecclesiiale* of Alexandre de Villedieu, published in 1203 and generally believed to contain references to Arnulfus' lectures and commentary on the *Fasti*.¹² It is therefore highly unlikely that Arnulfus, whose lectures and commentary were apparently well known by 1203, could have

⁵ This commentary, of which I am at present preparing an edition, survives wholly or in part in six manuscripts, *Vat. Reg. 1548*, *Turicensis Rh. 76*, *Bodl. Auct. F. iv. 27*, *Paris. 8241*, *Bodl. Canon. Lat. Class. I, Plant. Moret. 174*. The Vatican manuscript, the best of the group, is used as the basis of the text.

⁶ *M. A. Lucani Pharsalia*, ed. C. F. Weber (Leipzig, 1831), 3.xx–xxiii; F. Ghisalberti, "Arnolfo d'Orleans, un cultore di Ovidio nel secolo xii," *Memorie del R. Istituto Lombardo di scienze e lettere* (Milan, 1932) *passim*.

⁷ Ghisalberti, *op. cit.*, 158.

⁸ E. Faral, *Les arts poétiques du xii^e et du xiii^e siècle* (Paris, 1924) 3.

⁹ Scribendi regit arte stylum, Rufoque negante

Laudem Matthaeus Vindoci <n>ensis habet.

(in J. A. Fabricius, *Bibliotheca Latina mediae et infimae aetatis* [2 vols., Hamburg, 1734, 1736] 5.226). A gloss on the lines explains: Hic nominat alium qui dicitur Mattheus Vindoniensis et vocatur summa dictandi Matthei Vindoniensis et incipit "spiritus invidiae cessat" et habuit quendam Rufum inimicum . . . (C. Thurot, *CRAI* n.s. 6 (1870) 263). Another gloss on the same lines reads: Matthaëus describit contra Rufum Curialium doctrinas, et obtinet victorias et laudes contra ipsum (Fabricius, *loc. cit.*, note d.).

¹⁰ B. M. Marti, "Arnulfus and the *Faits des Romains*," *MLQ* 2 (1941) 3.

¹¹ K. Sneyders de Vogel, "La date des *Faits des Romains*," *NPh* 17 (1932) 213f., 271.

¹² Sacrificare deis nos edocet Aurelianus,
Indicens festum Fauni Iovis atque Liei.
Hec est pestifera, David testante, cathedra,

used Hugutio, who was at work upon his *Derivationes* as late as 1197-1201.

There are two alternative explanations of their similarities. That Hugutio might have used Arnulfus is certainly possible; but whether this was the case or whether both Arnulfus and Hugutio are indebted to a common source, can, with the present state of the external evidence, be settled only on the internal evidence of the material common to both writers. In gathering the following parallels I have included only those which present material peculiar, in greater or less degree, to Hugutio and Arnulfus or in which Hugutio and Arnulfus are closer either in substance or in wording than is the corresponding material in other sources.

ARNULFUS ¹³

Introduction: nefastus enim dicitur a nefas quasi illicitus, eo quod illicitum et quasi nefas erat in illa die negocia agere, causas exercere, uel aliquid tale, eo quod in illa die male contigerat Romanis.¹⁵ fuit autem uetus consuetudo apud Romanos ut quascumque prosperitates siue aduersitates sustinerent eas in fastis

HUGUTIO ¹⁴

S.v. Facio: a fas fastus a um et a nefas nefastus a um, ut fastus dies dicitur licitus, in quo Romanis licebat negocia agere, causas exercere, uel aliquid tale. nefastus dicitur dies quasi illicitum et quod nefas erat in illo die predicta negocia agere, quia in illo die male contigerat Romanis.¹⁵ fuit siquidem

In qua non sedit vir sanctus, perniciosam
Doctrinam fugiens, que sicut habetur ibidem,
Est quasi diffundens multis contagia morbus.

* * *

Aurelianiste via non patet ad Paradisum,
Ni prius os mutet.

Falsum de fastis fatuus legat. Ecclesiasticus
Vera kalendaris sit cara scientia nobis.

(in C. Thurot, *Notices et Extraits des Manuscrits* 22, 2 [1868] 115, 98). Cf. also L. Delisle, "Les écoles d'Orléans au douzième et au treizième siècle," *Annuaire Bulletin de la Soc. de l'Hist. de France* 7 (1869) 145; and B. Hauréau, *Hist. litt. de la France* 29.576.

¹³ Lemmata from the text of Ovid will be represented in capitals.

¹⁴ I have used photographs of *MS Bod. Laud. 626*. Unfortunately a number of pages are missing from this manuscript at various points, and war conditions have made it impossible to obtain photographs of other manuscripts. Some of the missing pages might well have provided material of importance for comparison with Arnulfus. An edition of Hugutio is being prepared by A. Marigo, who has already published a list of all the manuscripts of the *Derivationes* (*I codici manoscritti delle "Derivationes" di Ugucione Pisano*, Rome, 1936).

¹⁵ Cf. Gellius, 5.17.1f.; Festus Pauli, s.v. *Nonarum* (Lindsay, 187); Macrobius, *Sat.* 1.16.21-25. These authorities parallel the substance but not the wording of Arnulfus and Hugutio.

annotari facerent, ut per eas notatas exemplum posteris relinquerent et sic ad uirtutem eos animarent¹⁶ . . . queritur, cum de fastis et de nefastis agat diebus, quare potius a fastis quam a nefastis intituatur, ad quod dicimus quod a digniori parte intitulatur, sicut Uirgilius bucolica intitulauit apoton bucolon,¹⁷ id est a bobus, id est a digniori parte rusticane professionis. uidendus est quorundam error qui fastos dies appellant non festiuos, nefastos uero festiuos, sed inueniuntur quidam de fastis festiui et de nefastis quidam non festiui. praua est eorum sententia qui hoc tenent. mirum enim esset si dies in quibus sibi male contigerat pro sollempnibus haberent. illos siquidem celebrabant, sed non causa sollempnitatis, immo [sed MSS TPC] timore infortunii.

Fasti 1.47: comitalis [i.e. dies] in quo eligebantur consules uel intronizabantur.¹⁹

Fasti 1.55: dicitur Idus diuisio mensis, [uel] quia tunc diuidebantur a nundinis.²⁰ iduare enim est

uetus consuetudo apud Romanos ut quascumque aduersitates siue prosperitates sustinerent eas in fastis notari facerent.¹⁶ illos ergo dies in quibus sibi male contigerat celebrabant non causa sollempnitatis, sed timore infortunii, et uocabantur nefasti; sed illi in quibus eis bene contigerat uocabantur fasti quasi liciti, quia in eis licebat illas causas agere et huiusmodi, uel quia in eis fabatur ius.¹⁸ et hinc quidam liber Ouidii, in quo tractabatur de fastis et nefastis diebus, a digniori parte intitulatur liber fastorum. hinc et annales libri in quibus scribebantur facta Romanorum totius anni similiter a digniori parte dicti sunt fasti.

S.v. Como: hoc comitium cii, id est tempus in quo consules eliguntur uel intronizantur. et etiam ipsa electio uel intronizatio dicitur comitium, uel sollempnitas que ibi tunc fiebat conuentu totius populi et locus in quo fiebat.¹⁹

S.v. Idus: Idus, Iduum, Idibus, id est diuisio, unde quidem mensis dicitur Idus quasi diuisio, quia tunc

¹⁶ Cf. the passage in an Introduction to the *Fasti* contained in *Monacensis 19475 Tegerns. 1475*), s. xii (G. Przychocki, *Accessus Ovidiani* [Krakow, 1911] 30): Mos erat Romanorum antiquitus, ut quacunque die aduersitates vel prosperitates sustinerent, in Fastis eas notari facerent, ut per eas notatas exemplum bonae vitae relinquerent posteris et sic animos eorum ad perenne decus excitarent.

¹⁷ Serv. *Buc.*, *Proem.*

¹⁸ Cf. Isid. *Etym.* 6.18.1.

¹⁹ Cf. Fest. Paul. s.v. *Comitiales* (Lindsay, 34); Gell. 13.15.4; 15.27.4; Serv. *Aen.* 4.102.

²⁰ The phrase "[uel] . . . nundinis" is dislocated in the manuscripts of Arnulfus, where it follows "mensis sequentis." I have emended the passage in accordance with Hugutio's version. If this dislocation was present in the archetype of Arnulfus' commentary, the fact that Hugutio's version is correct while that of Arnulfus is not might point to the use of a common source rather than the use of Arnulfus by Hugutio.

diuidere, unde dicitur uidua quasi a uiro iduata. Idus ergo dicitur quia mensem diuidit, non quia in Idibus fit medietas mensis cuiuslibet, sed quia diuisio est mensis in quo est Idus. ab Idibus enim mensis non computatur nisi per Kalendas mensis sequentis.²¹

diuidebantur a nundinis, que durabant a Nonis usque ad Idus, uel quia tunc diuiditur mensis, non quia in Idibus sit medietas eius mensis, sed quia in Idibus est diuisio mensis quantum ad appellationem dierum. ab Idibus enim mensis non [nunc *MS*] computatur nisi per Kalendas sequentis mensis . . . et ab Idus quod est diuisio dicitur iduo as, id est diuidere; et Idus uel iduo componitur cum uiro et dicitur uidua quasi uiridua, id est a uiro idua et diuisa.²¹ proprie quidem uidua dicitur que cum uiro diu fuit.

Fasti 1.103: quidam deum mundum esse dicebant, quem deum ipsi Ianum uocabant . . . quod habet duas portas, unam a Capricorno per quam ascendit, aliam a Cancro per quam descendit. celum uero uocauerunt Ianum, quia ianua erat ascendentium et descendentium. 125: fores celi sunt oriens et occidens . . . uel fores celi sunt Cancer et Capricornus²² . . .

S.v. Iam: Ianus dicitur mundus uel celum, quod habet duas facies uel portas, scilicet orientem et occidentem, uel Cancrum uel Capricornum.²²

Fasti 1.141: . . . Ecate habeat tres potestates et ita tria capita.²³ est enim Luna in celo, Diana in siluis, Proserpina apud inferos,²⁴ unde etiam tria habet sacrificia.

S.v. Dyan: Dyana . . . eadem et Triuia, quia tres habeat potestates, unde et tribus fingitur figuris. est enim Dyana in siluis, Luna in celo, Proserpina apud inferos.²⁴

²¹ Cf. Macrob. *Sat.* 1.15.17: . . . Idus vocemus diem qui diuidit mensem. Iduare enim Etrusca lingua dividere est: unde uidua, quasi valde idua, id est valde diuisa: aut uidua, id est a uiro diuisa; Papias (ed. Philippus de Pincis, Venice, 1496): Idus dicitur diuisio scilicet mensis. iduare enim dividere dicitur: unde uidua dicitur a uiro diuisa. . . . [I have learned, through the kindness of Professor B. L. Ullman, that there is at Florence a manuscript of Papias which differs greatly in some respects from the printed editions and includes some material that they do not. It is of course impossible at present to obtain photostats for comparison.]

²² Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 7.610; Macrob. *Sat.* 1.9.9, 11; Isid. *Etym.* 8.11.37, 13.1.7; Papias, s.v. *Ianus*. The references to *portae* and to Cancer and Capricorn distinguish Arnulfus and Hugutio from the others.

²³ No doubt by analogy with Janus, who is the subject of Ovid's discussion.

²⁴ Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 4.511. The phraseology, "habeat tres potestates" and "est enim . . . inferos" is peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio.

Fasti 1.454: lautus non est sincopatum, ut dicunt quidam, a laudatus,²⁵ quem ad modum nec partus a paratus, immo a pario paris diriuatur. et dicitur proprie res sibi parta res labore adquisita.²⁶ laborat enim mulier cum parit.

S.v. Laudo: quidam dicunt quod lautus est sincopatum pro laudatus,²⁵ quod non credimus esse uerum.

S.v. Pario: . . . facere uel laborare, acquirere²⁶ et est hec significatio tracta ex alia, quia cum mulier parit acquirit et in labore est.

Fasti 1.455: DEE NOCTIS id est Nictilie que dicitur a nictis quod est nox.

S.v. Nictos uel nix: nictos Grece dicitur nox, unde Nictilius a um, id est nocturnus.

Fasti 1.637: . . . templum Iunonis Monete . . . ita dicitur quia monuit Romanos per anserem cum Senones nocte inuaderent urbem.²⁷

S.v. Moneo: Moneta dicta est Iuno quia monuit Romanos per anserem.²⁷

Fasti 1.693: far genus est annone. . . .

S.v. Frango: hoc far ris quoddam genus annone.

Fasti 2.519: far genus est grosse annone.

Fasti 2.3: ELEGI uersus facti de miseria.²⁹

S.v. El: ab el quod est deus²⁸ dicitur quoddam aduerbium Grecum, scilicet eleyson, id est miserrere . . . et ab eleyson elegus a um, id est miser a um, unde uersus facti de miseria dicuntur eligi.²⁹

Fasti 3.553: ELISSA proprium nomen est Didonis. Dido uero dicta fuit quasi uirago.³⁰ uel Elissa dicta est a miseria. eleis enim Grece miseria Latine, unde eleiso <n>, id est miserere, et elegi uersus de miseria.³¹

S.v. Elissa: hec Elissa se fuit proprium nomen Didonis et quia dicta est Dido ab euentu quasi uirago³⁰ quia uiriliter se interfecit.

²⁵ The *quidam* referred to by both Arnulfus and Hugutio could be Osbern (*Classi-corum Auctorum* . . . *Tomus VIII*, ed. A. Mai, Rome, 1836), who says (s.v. *Laudo*): lautus a um, id est laudatus per syncopam. Contamination in a Greco-Latin glossary may have been the cause of the error (cf. *Glossae Emendatae* [Goetz, *Corpus Glossariorum Latinorum*, vols. 6, 7]: Lautus λαμπρόβιος ἐπαυερός, μέγας; laudatus, ἐπαυερός).

²⁶ Cf. Mart. 10.47.3: Res . . . parta labore; *Gl. Emend.*: Parta adquisita; Papias: Parta: acquisita. . . .

²⁷ Cf. *Schol. Lucan.* (ed. C. F. Weber, *M. A. Lucani Pharsalia* 3.61f.; ed. H. Usener, Leipzig, 1869) 1.380; *Schol. Iuv.* (ed. P. Wessner, Leipzig, 1931) 11.111. The phrase "quia . . . anserem" is peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio.

²⁸ Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 1.642.

²⁹ See note 31.

³⁰ Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 1.340, 4.36, 335, 674. The phrases "proprium nomen Didonis" and "quasi uirago" are peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio.

³¹ Cf. Diom. *Ars Gramm.* 3 (*GLK* 1.484); Papias, s.v. *Eleison*. Arnulfus and Hugutio are distinguished by the definition of elegiacs as "uersus facti de miseria."

Fasti 2.21: flamen dicitur quasi filamen ab albo filo quod gerebat in capite. LANAS flosculos lane quos ferebant sicut et fila.³²

Fasti 2.23: LICTOR dicitur sacerdos uel minister qui sacrificat a litando, ut quidam uolunt; uel a linquendo—interfecta enim uictima paruo tempore non attingebant eam; uel qui portat gladium ante imperatorem; uel lictor, is est lator cadauerum.³³ . . .

Fasti 2.31: sacerdotes Panis . . . februa faciebant, id est purgationes, unde dicebatur Februarius. 33: . . . sacrificabatur manibus in illo mense [i.e. Februario], qui manes februi dicuntur.³⁴

S.v. Filon: a filon hic flamen nis sacerdos Iouis quasi filamen quia reliquias a colo per fila dependentes portet. uel dicitur a filo quia quicumque erat sacerdos in signum sacerdocii deferebat almucium, sed ingruente calore, cum ex caloris nimietate non posset deferre illud, religabant sibi capillos quodam filo. uel flosculum lane filo in uertice ligatum deferebant in signum sacerdocii.³²

S.v. Lito: litat qui sacrificium facit, . . . unde . . . hic lictor ris qui de officio portat gladium uel securim ante regem uel imperatorem . . . et dicitur lictor quasi litor a litando . . . item lictor dicitur portator cadauerum, scilicet qui portat cadauera ad bustum, similiter a litando uel a ferendo quasi lator³³ . . .

S.v. Faueo: . . . pluraliter hec februa orum, id est sacrificia purgationis, que olim solebant fieri pro animabus defunctorum. unde februatius a um, id est purgatus, et februo as, id est sacrificare uel purgare, et hic februus, id est Pluto. februi etiam dicuntur manes quia eis fiebant huiusmodi purgationes. et a februus hic Februarius quidam mensis quasi sacrificatorius uel purgatorius quia in illo mense precipue fiebant februa pro animabus defunctorum, unde Februarius.³⁴

³² Cf. Fest. Paul. s.v. *Albogalerus, Flamen Dialis* (Lindsay, 9, 77); Serv. *Aen.* 8.664; Isid. *Etym.* 7.12.18f.; *Mythogr. Val.* 3.6.34; Papias, s.v. *Flamine, Flamen dialis*; Osbern, gloss, p. 240. The distinguishing elements in Arnulfus and Hugutio are the references to "flosculos lane" and "flosculum lane" respectively.

³³ Cf. *Gl. Emend.* s.v. *Lictor*; Papias s.v. *Lictor, Lictores*. The derivation of *lictor*, one who sacrifices, from *lito* and the descriptions of a lictor as a bearer of corpses or one who bears a sword before an *imperator* are details peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio. The derivation from *linquo* occurs only in Arnulfus.

³⁴ Cf. Fest. Paul. s.v. *Februarius* (Lindsay, 75f.); *Gl. Emend.* s.v. *Februare, Februarium*; Papias, s.v. *Februare*; *Mythogr. Val.* 3.4.3. Peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio is the statement that the *manes* were called *februi*.

Fasti 2.34: FERALES a feron quod est mors.

S.v. Feron: feron Grece Latine mors dicitur, unde . . . hic et hec feralis et hoc te, id est mortalis, lugubris.³⁵

Fasti 2.190: Septemtriones dicuntur a septem stellis. trion enim Grece stella est Latine.³⁶

S.v. Tero: trio Grece Latine dicitur stella, inde Septentrio a numero septem stellarum.³⁶

Fasti 2.257: YDRUM serpentem aquaticum, ab idor quod est aqua.³⁷

S.v. Idra uel idor: idra uel idor Grece Latine dicitur aqua, inde . . . hic Idrus [idrius *MS*] et hec Ydra serpens aquaticus.³⁷

Fasti 2.282: DIALIS id est unius diei, quia uno die tantum durabat; uel DIALIS id est iouialis a Greco dian quod interpretatur Iupiter.

S.v. Deus: hic dialis lis sacerdos Iouis,³⁸ sed potius dicitur a die, ut post dicitur.

Fasti 6.226: CONIUNX DIALIS id est sacerdotis unius diei, cui non liceat nisi per unum diem in toto anno sacra facere, uel quia licebat ei de die sacrificare, cum quibusdam non liceret. uel DIALIS a dian Grece quod est Iupiter Latine³⁹ et dicitur dialis quasi iouialis.

S.v. Dyan: a dies hic et hec dialis et hoc le . . . unde dictus est hic dialis sacerdos Iouis.³⁹

Fasti 2.389: ALBULA solebat uocari fluius qui modo dicitur Tiberis a rege Tiberino ibi submerso.

S.v. Albo: hec Albula le quidam fluius qui modo Tyberinus a Tyberi <n> rege ibi submerso dicitur.

Fasti 4.48: . . . amnis qui prius Albula dicebatur a colore dictus est Tiberis a Tiberino ibi submerso.

S.v. Tiberinus: Tiberinus fluius Romanus a Tiberino rege Alba-

³⁵ Cf. *Gl. Emend.*: Feralis mortalis; Feralia lugubria. The word *feron*, peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio, appears to have been invented to account for *feralis*.

³⁶ Cf. Osbern, gloss, p. 590: Triones . . . aliquando stellae.

³⁷ Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 6.287; Isid. *Etym.* 12.4.21f.; *Mythogr. Vat.* 3.13.4; *Gl. Emend.* s.v. *Hydrus*; Papias, s.v. *Hidra*; Osbern, s.v. *Ἰδρω*, and gloss, p. 289. The combination of the derivation from *idor* with adjective *aquaticus* is peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio.

³⁸ Cf. Osbern, s.v. *Deus*: hic dialis, lis, sacerdos Iouis.

³⁹ Cf. Fest. Paul. (Lindsay, 65): Dies dictus, quod divini sit operis, sive ab Iove, eius, ut putabant, rectore, qui Graece *Δία* appellatur; sive quod aer diurnus dehiscat in candorem. Arnulfus and Hugutio have in common the form *dian* (*dyan*). There is no reason, aside from the use of this form, why Hugutio could not have got his derivation from Festus; but Arnulfus' derivation of *dialis* directly from *dian*, with no mention of the intermediary *dies*, suggests that he was using a work in which the etymological material was arranged under the large general headings of parent words and where he found the derivation of *dialis* under *dian* without noticing that it was derived more immediately from *dies*.

Fasti 6.410: CEPERAT NOMEN AB AMNE ADUERSO id est a submersione Tyberini regis, a quo dictus est Tiberis, qui prius dicebatur Albula.⁴⁰ norum in eo submerso sic dictus.⁴⁰

Fasti 2.451: LUCINA dicitur . . . a luce quam prebet nascentibus.⁴¹ S.v. Dyan: Dyana . . . est et Lucina quia luceat uel quia lucem prebeat nascentibus.

S.v. Luceo: dicitur Lucina quia nascentibus prebeat lucem.⁴¹ . . .

Fasti 2.461: DIONE Uenus, cum tamen Dione mater fuit Ueneris, ut dicit Claudianus [*Rapt. Proserp.* 4.102]: "Sic Uenerem querat deserta Dione," sicut ego Ceres quero Proserpinam mihi raptam. S.v. Dyan: inde dicta est Dione Uenus quia pulchra sit; uel dicta est Dyone a matre sua que similiter dicta est Dyone, unde Claudianus de raptu Proserpine [4.102]: "Si <c> Uenerem querat deserta Dyone."

Fasti 3.89: ALBANIS id est populis illis ab alba scrofa dictis.⁴² S.v. Albo: hec Alba quedam ciuitas, eo quod alba scropha fuit inuenta ibi.⁴²

Fasti 3.377: ANCILE ab an quod est circum et cile quod est corruptum a cedo dis, quia circumcisum fuit et rotundum.⁴³ S.v. Cedo: cedo componitur et dicitur ancido, mutata m in n, circumcirca cedo, unde ancile lis, id est scutum rotundum quasi ancisum . . . uel componitur ancile ab am et cile, sicut postea dicitur. S.v. Chile: a cile quod est labium et am quod est circum dicitur hoc

⁴⁰ Cf. Liv. 1.3.8; Fest. Paul. s.v. *Albula* (Lindsay, 4); Serv. *Aen.* 3.500, 8.330; Isid. *Etym.* 13.21.27; *Mythogr. Val.* 1.193; Papias, s.v. *Tyberis*. The versions of Arnulfus and Hugutio are distinguished from the rest by the variations on the phrase "a rege Tiberino ibi submerso."

⁴¹ Cf. Porph. *Carm.* 3.12.2; Philarg. *Georg.* 3.60; Mart. Cap. 149; *Mythogr. Val.* 3.4.3; Papias, s.v. *Lucina*. The use of *praebeo* distinguishes the versions of the third Mythographer, Arnulfus, and Hugutio from the rest. In the third Mythographer, however, the context is different, "nascentibus portam praebeat luminis."

⁴² Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 1.270, 8.43; Isid. *Etym.* 15.1.53. The use of the word *scrofa* is peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio.

⁴³ Cf. Fest. Paul. s.v. *Am* (Lindsay, 4); Vel. Long. *De Orthogr.* (GLK 7.74); Charis. *Inst. Gramm.* I (GLK 1.102); Cassiod. *De Orthogr.* (GLK 7.155); Serv. *Aen.* 8.664; Isid. *Etym.* 18.12.3; *Gl. Emend.* s.v. *Ancile*; Papias, s.v. *Ancyle*; Osbern, s.v. *Am*, *Caedo*, and gloss, p. 53. These authorities account among them for all the material of Arnulfus and Hugutio, except the form of *cile* (*chile*), which is spelled thus in none of them. It is worth noting that in Arnulfus the two etymologies, from *caedo* and *cile*, are telescoped and that Arnulfus in this instance therefore could scarcely be the source of Hugutio.

ancile lis, scutum quod cecidit de celo Numa sacrificante, quasi circumcirca labiosum.⁴³

Fasti 3.558: LACUS dolia in quibus uinum liquatur, unde et Bacchus a lacu Lieus dicitur; uel secundum quosdam a ligo ligas quia homines ligat; uel a lien Grece ⁴⁴ quod est calix Latine.

S.v. Lenio: a lenio hic Leneus ei, id est Bacchus, quia leniat curas uel quia sit lenis ad potandum. uel Leneus dicitur a lenon quod est lacus uel cupa in quem uel in quam uinum decurrit expressum et etiam lacum dicitur Bacchus producere et inde Leneus a um, id est Bachicus a um.

S.v. Lien: a lien hic Lieus ei, id est Bacchus,⁴⁴ quia de splene risus procedit et ebrii semper rident; ⁴⁵ uel Lieus a ligo as quia ligat linguam et impedit.

Fasti 3.607: ACATES cura interpretatur que semper reges et potentes comitatur, unde comes huius [i.e. Aeneae] dicitur; uel lapis qui facit inuisibilem illum cui adheret.⁴⁶

S.v. Achates: achates genus lapidis. si quis portauerit semper erit graciosus, sicut Eneas qui eum portabat in uagina, unde et dicitur fuisse armiger Enee. uel aliunde: achos enim Grece cura Latine. inde Achates dicitur fuisse comes Enee quia cura et sollicitudo comitatur magnates.⁴⁶

Fasti 3.819: PERCURRERE TELA id est texere. RADIO naucula est qua filum inter fila deducitur. STANTES quia stando solebant texere; uel STANTES dicitur propter fila stancia, unde stamen dicitur filum in longitudine tele positum ⁴⁷ a stando, subtegmen

S.v. Rado: radius ii instrumentum texendi uel pecten uel naucula uel lignum quod distinguit stamina.

S.v. Stasis: hoc stamen inis filum tele, scilicet orditura, quia stantes solebant texere et tela erecta solebat deponi rursum pendens de trabe.

⁴⁴ Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 4.207, *Georg.* 2.4; Fulg. *Mitol.* 2.12; Isid. *Etym.* 8.11.44, 20.3.2; *Mythogr. Vat.* 1.120, 2.80, 3.12.2, 3; *Gl. Emend.* s.v. *Lenaeus*; Papias, s.v. *Lyaeus*, *Lyen*, *Lenaeus*; Osbern, s.v. *Lenio*, and gloss, p. 324. Peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio is the etymology involving *ligo*. Arnulfus, moreover, fails to distinguish between the two titles *Lieus* and *Leneus*, and in some mysterious way connects *lien* with *calix*.

⁴⁵ Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 6.596, 8.219; Isid. *Etym.* 11.1.127; *Gl. Emend.* s.v. *Splen*; Osbern, gloss, p. 562.

⁴⁶ Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 1.174, 312; *Mythogr. Vat.* 3.11.4; Papias, s.v. *Achates*. The use of *comitatur* is peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio. There is no parallel for the magical property attributed to the stone by Arnulfus.

⁴⁷ Cf. Isid. *Etym.* 19.29.1: Tela pro longitudine staminum dicta. . . .

uero quod ex obliquo cum naucula
subtextitur.

820: PECTINE instrumentum est
textricum.

Fasti 4.695: UERTEBAT TE-
LAM TIBICINE instrumentum
est textricum quo densatur tela.
STANTI dixit quia stando solebant
texere, sicut hodie texuntur sacci.

Fasti 4.182: IDEE is est Troiane,
ab Ida silua Troiana.

207: IDE silua Cretensis.

249: IDA silua iuxta Troiam.

S.v. Ida: Ida de dicitur quedam
silua in Creta et quedam silua iuxta
Troiam.

Fasti 4.210: CORIBANTES sacer-
dotes Cibeles dicti quasi coro-
boantes, id est sonantes.

S.v. Chorus: chorus componitur
cum boo as quod est sonare et
dicitur hic et hec coribas bantis et
sunt coribantes sacerdotes Cybeles
quasi coroboantes.

Fasti 4.222: Muse Pierides dicun-
tur a filiabus Pieri quas cantando
deuicerunt,⁴⁸ uel a Piero monte⁴⁹
ubi habitant.

S.v. Pierus: Pierus pater fuit nouem
picarum quas nouem Muse deuice-
runt. ideo ab illis Muse dicte sunt
Pierides.⁴⁸

Fasti 4.287: Sicilia dicta Trinacria
a tribus montibus, scilicet Lilibeo,
Pachimno, et Peloro. acros enim
mons interpretatur.⁵⁰ ibi sunt Ci-
clopes fabri Iouis, scilicet Piragmon
et alii. pir interpretatur ignis, ac-
mon incus. inde dicitur Piragmon,
id est numquam recedens ab incude
et igne.⁵¹

S.v. Tris: componitur cum acros
quod est mons et dicitur hec Tri-
nacria a tribus montibus, scilicet
Pachimno, Lilibeo, et Peloro.⁵⁰

S.v. Pir: pir Grece Latine dicitur
ignis . . . componitur cum acmon
quod est incus et dicitur hic Pirac-
mon onis faber Iouis, fulminum eius
fabricator, et dicitur sic quasi ignea
incus ab igne et incude quia semper
sit iuxta ignem et incudem.⁵¹

Fasti 4.458: MENADES sacerdo-
tisse sunt Bachi, dicte sic a mene

S.v. Mene: a mene quod est de-
fectus hec menas adis, id est sacer-

⁴⁸ Cf. Ov. *Met.* 5.300–678; *Mythogr. Vat.* 1.86. The versions of Arnulfus and Hugutio are distinguished from those by virtue of vocabulary and summarized form.

⁴⁹ Cf. Plin. *Nat.* 4.30; *Gl. Emend.* s.v. *Pieris*.

⁵⁰ Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 1.196, 3.384, 687; Isid. *Etym.* 14.6.32; *Mythogr. Vat.* 3.8.8; *Gl. Emend.* s.v. *Trinacria*; Papias, s.v. *Trinacria*, which read *promontoria* or *extremilates* rather than *montes*.

⁵¹ Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 8.425; *Mythogr. Vat.* 3.10.5. The term *faber Iouis* is peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio.

quod est defectio. deficiunt enim in mente cum inebriate sunt.

Fasti 6.504: MENADES sacerdotissas Bachi que deficiunt in sensu et dicuntur a mene quod est defectio.⁵²

Fasti 4.471: ORTIGIAM insula sic dicta ab Ortix Grece quod interpretatur coturnix Latine. in eam mutata est Asterie, soror Latone, miseratione deorum, dum eam Iupiter, in specie aquile insequeretur, ut eam opprimeret.⁵³

Fasti 4.731: SUFFIMEN piamen, a suffire deriuatur quod est subfumigare, unde in georgicis [4.241]: "Suffire thimo."⁵⁴

Fasti 4.883: ADSCISCERE aduocare.⁵⁵

Fasti 5.37: anguinos pedes habuerunt [i.e. Gigantes] quia uelocissimi fuerunt sicut quoddam genus ser-

dotissa Bachi, quia deficiat a sensu.⁵²

S.v. Ortix: Ortix tigris Grece Latine dicitur coturnix, unde hec Ortigia a quadam insula, scilicet Delos. cum enim Iupiter insequeretur Asteriem, sororem Latone, afflauit eam et uersa est in coturnicem et ipse mutauit se in accipitrem, uel in aquilam, secundum alios, et cepit eam insequi. que cum euadere non posset, miseratione deorum mutata est in lapidem qui diu latuit sub aqua maris et postea excreuit in insula que postea apparuit. unde Delos dicta est et Ortigia ab Asterie [ortigie *MS*] in eam mutata.⁵³

S.v. Fio: componitur suffio fui fitum, id est subfumigare uel administrare. Uirgilius [*Georg.* 4.241]: "At suffire timo cerasque recidere inanes."⁵⁴

S.v. Scio: adscio scis, id est aduoca, unde asciscere scis et adsciscere scis.⁵⁵

S.v. Ango: Gigantes dicti sunt habentes anguinos pedes uel quia astuti erant ad modum anguis uel

⁵² Cf. *Mythogr. Vat.* 3.12.3; Papias, s.v. *Mena*. The definition of *mene* as *defectio* or *defectus*, and the phrase *deficere in (a) sensu* are peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio.

⁵³ Cf. Hyg. *Fab.* 53; Serv. *Aen.* 3.72, 73; *Mythogr. Vat.* 1.37, 2.17, 3.8.3; Papias, s.v. *Ortygia*. The versions of Arnulfus and Hugutio are distinguished from the others not only in phraseology, but also by their references to Jupiter's disguising himself as a bird.

⁵⁴ Cf. Serv. *Georg.* 4.241; Prisc. *Inst.* 8.83, 10.50 (GLK 2.436, 539); *Comm. Einsidl. in Don. Art. Maior.* (GLK Suppl. 256); Osborn, s.v. *Facio*, and gloss, p. 559. The combination of the synonym *suffumigare* with the quotation from the *Georgics* occurs only in Arnulfus and Hugutio.

⁵⁵ Cf. Papias, s.v. *Adscio*; Osborn, s.v. *Scio*, and gloss, p. 58. The synonym *aduoco* is peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio.

pentium, uel quia terrenis incubuerunt.⁵⁶

Fasti 5.80: . . . Calliope quasi calophone, id est bona sonoritas.⁵⁷

Fasti 5.81: THITANIDA THE-TIN non matrem Achillis sed magnam⁵⁸ Thitanida dicit quia de genere Gigantum fuit qui de quodam Titane descenderunt. hec declinatur Thetis Thecios et est prima longa, illa uero Thetis Thetidis et breuiatur prima.⁵⁹

Fasti 5.83: CELIFERO celum dicitur Atlas sustinere, id est scientiam celi, quia optimus fuit astrologus.⁶⁰ UERTICE quia in cerebro locus est scientie a quo didicit Hercules eandem scientiam, unde celum quoque sustinuisse dicitur. 169: HONERATUS HUMEROS mutatus in montem. ideo enim fingitur celum sustinere quia mons est altissimus uel quia philosophus fuit mirabilis et multum nouit de celestibus.⁶¹

Fasti 5.104: FURIBUS APTE FIDIS id est fidelis. inuenit [i.e. Mercurius] enim prestigium, artem scilicet quandam, per quam homines fiunt inuisibiles, que ars conuenit furibus. prestigium dicitur

quia serpeba <n> t in terrenis tantum in eis confidentes.⁵⁶

S.v. Calon: hec Calliope pes una de ix Musis, quasi calon phone, id est bona sonoritas.⁵⁷

S.v. Thetis: hec Thetis tis uel [ut *MS*] Thecios, prima producta, id est mare, id est uxor Oceani. hec Thetis tis uel dis, prima correpta, id est mater Achillis.⁵⁹

S.v. Athlas: Athlas pater Promethei fuit optimus astrologus rex Affrice, unde dictus est celum sustinuisse et a nomine eius dictus est mons Affrice mons Athlas quia propter altitudinem dictus est celum sustinuisse.⁶¹

S.v. Stringo: hoc prestigium quedam species magice artis, scilicet humanorum sensuum illusio, et dicitur prestigium a prestringendo quia aciem oculorum prestringit. sed per prestigium incredibiles re-

⁵⁶ Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 3.578; Macrobius *Sat.* 1.20.9; *Mythogr. Vat.* 2.53, 3.1.10. The versions of Arnulfus and Hugutio are distinguished from the others by the use of *anguinos pedes* and *terrenis*.

⁵⁷ Cf. Fulg. *Mitol.* 1.15; *Mythogr. Vat.* 1.114, 2.24, 3.8.18; Papias, s.v. *Calliope*. The interpretation of Calliope as *bona sonoritas* is peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio.

⁵⁸ Cf. *Mythogr. Vat.* 1.204 (Maior Thetis).

⁵⁹ Cf. Papias: Tethys uxor oceani; mater nimpharum; Thetis etiam mater Achillis; Tethys yos thetis thetidos graece et thetidis latine. The remarks on quantity occur only in Arnulfus and Hugutio.

⁶⁰ The phrase "quia . . . astrologus" appears only in *Bodl. Auct. F.iv.27*.

⁶¹ Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 1.741; *Mythogr. Vat.* 3.13.4. Peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio are the references to the great height of Mt. Atlas and to Atlas himself as an expert *astrologus*.

a pre et Stige que est palus infernalis quia inferis ars illa est sacrata.⁶²

Fasti 5.159: IPERIO interpretatur omnia excedens. sol enim omnes planetas excedit non altitudine sed dignitate.

Fasti 5.192: AUCTOR ab autentim Grece quod est auctoritas.⁶³

Fasti 5.288: . . . PUBLICII a Publicio qui constituit erarium Rome, a quo etiam dicta est res publica.⁶⁴

Fasti 5.291: MULTA a multo tas quod est punio punis.⁶⁵

Fasti 5.633: SUFFRAGIA sunt auxilia in uerbis.⁶⁶

rum mutaciones uidentur fieri . . . uel componitur a pre et Stige, quia quedam Stigalia sacra pre, id est ante faciunt.⁶²

S.v. Yper: yper id est super et componitur . . . cum on quod est totum uel omne et inde hic Yperion onis, id est super omnia, quod quandoque dicitur de Ioue qui super omnia est, quandoque de sole qui super faciem totius terre in circuitu fertur, quandoque de quodam Gigante qui super alios omnes sunt [*sic*].

S.v. Augeo: hic autor, id est augmentator, et debet scribi cum u et c. quando uero significat autentim, id est auctor, tunc est communis generis et debet scribi sine c, ut hic et hec autor, et deriuatur ab autentim.⁶³

S.v. Publius: Publius fuit quidam qui rem suam primo loco communem fecit et publicam. inde tractum est publicus a um, communis.⁶⁴

S.v. Moles: multo as, uerberare, punire, damnare . . . inde hec multa te, id est uindicta, pena.⁶⁵

S.v. Frango: suffragor, id est auxiliari et proprie in uerbis, scilicet precibus, unde hoc suffragium, id

⁶² Cf. Acro, *Carm.* 1.10.8; *Schol. in Hor. λψ* (ed. H. J. Botschuyver, Amsterdam, 1935) *Carm.* 1.10.8; *Epod.* 5.41f.; *Isid. Etym.* 8.9.33; *Gl. Emend.* s.v. *Prestigium*; Papias, s.v. *Prestigium*. Peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio are the etymologies involving *Styx*.

⁶³ Cf. *Gl. Emend.*: Authenticum auctoritas; Papias: Authentēs αὐθεντίας dominus auctor; Autenticum: auctoritate plenum firmum. The word *autentim* occurs only in Arnulfus and Hugutio.

⁶⁴ Cf. Plu. *Quaest. Rom.* 42; *Popl.* 12. Plutarch, who says that Valerius Poplicola established the treasury in the temple of Saturn, was not known in the West until the Renaissance. The derivations of Arnulfus and Hugutio probably represent a mediaeval invention.

⁶⁵ Cf. *Gl. Emend.* s.v. *Mullo*; Osborn, s.v. *Multus*, and glosses, p. 365. The glossing of *multo* as *punio* occurs only in Arnulfus and Hugutio.

est auxilium, et proprie in uerbis, scilicet preces.⁶⁶

Fasti 6.253: UALEANT id est pereant . . . tractum est ab illo funebri "uale."⁶⁷

S.v. Ualeo: hinc inuenitur uerbum defectiuum quod pertinet ad salutacionem in recessu, scilicet uale, ete, ualetote, ualere . . . idem tractum est ut ualeo ponatur pro perire uel infirmari . . . et nota [?] quod ualetudo inuenitur pro infirmitate et est nomen tractum ab illo funebri "uale" quod dicebatur mortuis.⁶⁷

Fasti 6.307: UACUNE que dea est uacantium et ociosorum.⁶⁸

S.v. Uaco: hec Uacuna ne dea uacationis et ocii.⁶⁸

Fasti 6.405: Uelabra loca sunt quasi macellum per quod pompa ibat in theatrum et dicuntur Uelabra a uelando propter farturas que ibi uelantur in pastillis et fladonibus. uel Uelabra uocant propter ipsos macellarios quorum erat istam pompam ducere. uel Uelabra sunt uie tecte per quas ibat pompa ad theatrum.⁶⁹

S.v. Uolo: Uelabrum bri dicitur a uelo as . . . locus Rome ita dictus ubi obsonia uendebantur uel illud quo pastilli et huiusmodi cibaria uelantur. Oracius [*Serm.*, 2.3.229]: "Cum scurris fartor [fautor *MS*] et cum Uelabro omne macellum."⁶⁹

Fasti 6.419: Ylios dicitur turris Troie, Asya regio terram continens.⁷⁰

S.v. Ilus: nota quod Troia regio est Asie, Ilium uero ciuitas Troie.⁷⁰ quandoque tamen Troia accipitur pro quadam eminentissima turre illius ciuitatis.

⁶⁶ Cf. *Gl. Emend.* s.v. *Suffragium*; Papias, s.v. *Suffragium*; Osbern, s.v. *Frango*. Peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio is the phrase "in uerbis."

⁶⁷ Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 2.644, 6.231, 11.97; *Mythogr. Vat.* 3.6.28f. The phrase, "tractum ab illo funebri 'uale'" appears only in Arnulfus and Hugutio.

⁶⁸ Cf. Acro, *Epist.* 1.10.49: Vacunam . . . deam uacationis dicunt.

⁶⁹ Cf. Hor. *Serm.* 2.3.229: cum scurris fartor, cum Velabro omne macellum; Acro, *Serm.* 2.3.229: Velabro] Locus Romae, ubi uictualia distrahentes frequentabant; *Ars Poet.* 67: Tiberim . . . deriuauit Augustus, qua nunc uadit; ante enim per Velabrum fluebat. Unde et Velabrum dictum, quod uelis transiretur; Papias: Velabrum dicitur quod uelis textitur; Velabrum a uelando dicitur: ut ille qui carni carnem imponit. It will be seen that these authorities, including, in the case of Arnulfus, the line of the *Fasti* which he was glossing (qua Velabra solent in Circum ducere pompas), account for most of the jumble of information given by Arnulfus and Hugutio. They are distinguished from their predecessors, however, by the terms in which they describe the food sold in the Velabrum, and notably by their use of the word *pastilli*.

⁷⁰ Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 1.1: Troia regio est Asiae, Ilium ciuitas Troiae.

Fasti 6.683: PER ESQUILIAS S.v. Edo: ab esca et ales hec
uicus est Rome.⁷¹ Esquiliae arum. uicus est Rome.⁷¹

Fasti 6.711: DIONE dicitur quasi S.v. Dyan: inde dicta est Dione
duos nectens. Uenus . . . quasi duos nectens in
amore.

The parallels collected above will have demonstrated conclusively that there exists between Arnulfus and Hugutio a very close relationship. I have already shown that it is impossible, chronologically, that Arnulfus should have used Hugutio.⁷² Two other possible explanations remain, that Hugutio used Arnulfus, or that both had a common source. On the evidence provided by the parallel passages I feel, however, that while one may *suggest* which of these solutions is the likelier, it is not possible to decide *conclusively* in favour of one or the other. The few instances of verbatim similarity and the greater number of cases in which one is briefer or fuller or differs in some details could all be explained on either hypothesis. That is, in the case of striking similarities, Hugutio might have copied verbatim from Arnulfus, or both from a common source; while, when they differ, it could be argued that Hugutio condensed Arnulfus or supplemented him with material from other sources or from his own imagination, or that one may have so treated a common source while the other reproduced it more accurately.

There are, however, a few clues, some of which seem to point in one direction, some in the other. As evidence for Hugutio's use of Arnulfus might be noted the fact that in the course of his discussion of *fasti* and *nefasti dies* which closely parallels that in the Introduction of Arnulfus,⁷³ Hugutio mentions "quidam liber Ouidii" which took its name, *Fasti*, from these *fasti* and *nefasti* days—evidence, conceivably, that he was using a commentary on the *Fasti*,⁷⁴ since Ovid's poem alone could not have provided the material which he gives. Similar evidence of use of a commentary appears (s.v. *Stasis*) where Hugutio has *stantes*, which occurs in Arnulfus (3.819) not in a gloss, but as a lemma from the text of the

⁷¹ Cf. Acro, *Serm.* 1.8.10; Papias, s.v. *Esquilia*. Arnulfus and Hugutio alone call the Esquiline a *uicus*.

⁷² See above, p. 260.

⁷³ See above, p. 262.

⁷⁴ It could, however, have been merely an Introduction such as that cited in note 16, which appears independently of any commentary.

Fasti. Another argument for Hugutio's use of Arnulfus is provided at 4.471, where Hugutio, in giving the etymology of Ortigia, mentions the version of *alii*, according to whom Jupiter when pursuing Asterie transformed himself into an eagle—which is exactly the version given by Arnulfus.⁷⁶

Several indications, on the other hand, point to the existence of a source common to both. At 1.55 in discussing *Idus*, Arnulfus, according at least to all the extant manuscripts of his commentary, gets one item⁷⁶ out of order, so that it makes no sense as it stands, while in Hugutio it occurs in its proper place—a possible explanation lying in a common source, incorrectly copied by Arnulfus, correctly by Hugutio. Second, at 3.558 *quidam* are cited by Arnulfus as authority for deriving *Lieus* from *ligo*, an etymology peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio.⁷⁷ Their notes on *lautus*, also attributed, both of them, to *quidam* (*Fasti* 1.454; s.v. *Lauro*), could be derived from this same common source.⁷⁸ If these references to *quidam* are indeed clues to a common source, Hugutio's mention of *alii* in connection with the story of Jupiter and Asterie, as well as the other bits of evidence which point to his use of Arnulfus, could then be accounted for as debts not to Arnulfus but to the same *quidam* to whom Arnulfus himself refers elsewhere (e.g. 3.558). This common source might be a body of derivations and etymologies now lost or unpublished,⁷⁹ or, if Hugutio's mention of the *Fasti* in his discussion of *fasti* and *nefasti dies* and his preservation of the Ovidian lemma *stantes* actually do indicate that he was using a commentary and not merely an introduction, it might be an earlier commentary such as Arnulfus seems frequently to have used in

⁷⁶ Whether the following, to me enigmatic, passage in Hugutio contains a reference to Arnulfus I do not know: s.v. *Madeo*: *immadeo intus uel ualde madere, unde quidam Aurelianus habet quod non habet Aurelianus uix bene perfecto quod non habet Aurelianus immaduit lacrimis Aurelianus habet*. It is of interest to note that from the first *Aurelianus* the passage scans as two hexameters and a pentameter.

⁷⁶ The phrase "[uel] tunc diuidebantur a nundinis."

⁷⁷ Although one may in general attach little importance to the *quidam* and *alii* cited as sources by mediaeval writers, since these very attributions, together with the material they accompany, frequently exist in some well-known authority, it would seem reasonable, however, to allow considerably more significance to such attributions when the material credited to them occurs nowhere else.

⁷⁸ See, however, note 25.

⁷⁹ Cf. Arnulfus' notes on *Fasti* 2.21 and 3.377, where the telescoping of his information could be explained on the hypothesis of careless use of etymological material arranged under the general headings of the parent word.

other connections and referred to likewise by the ambiguous designations *quidam* and *alii*.⁸⁰

The foregoing is offered only as conjecture. When more of the commentaries of Arnulfus are studied, material may be brought to light which will provide a definite solution of the problem. However it may one day be settled, the parallels collected above should be of value, either as demonstrating the indebtedness of Hugutio, a lexicographer of great importance in the late Middle Ages and the Renaissance, to Arnulfus, an Ovidian scholar of no little distinction for his time, or as representing at one remove an important source of both, now lost or at any rate unknown to us.

⁸⁰ See my dissertation, *An Unpublished Commentary on Ovid's "Fasti" by Arnulfus of Orléans* (Bryn Mawr, 1940 [unpublished]) 19-26.

ADDITIONAL NOTE

ARNULFUS

Fasti 3.105: Yades dicuntur ab ydor quod est aqua . . .

Fasti 5.165: . . . Yades quas Graeci uocant Yades quasi Hydardes ab ydor quod est aqua . . .

Fasti 3.769: NISIADES a Nisa ciuitate Parnasi.

HUGUTIO

S.v. Hiates: dicuntur Hiades ab ydor quod est aqua . . .

S.v. No: item a narus hic nasus si . . . nasus dicitur elacio, unde hec Nisa e quedam ciuitas que est in elaciori iugo Parnasi.

(Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 6.805: . . . Nisa civitas [in monte parnasso *add.* D])

Fasti 5.129: PRESTITI(BUS) LARIBUS . . . prestites dicuntur a presto tas quod est dono as quod est presum prees.

S.v. Stasis: presto as stiti titum, id est ante stare uel preesse uel . . . dare . . . a presto prestat pluraliter hii prestites presticium dei . . .

Fasti 5.351: Tetricus mons in Sabinia durus et asper, unde tetricus ca cum quasi durus ra rum.

S.v.: Teter: hic Tetricus ci quidam mons in Sabinia asperimus, unde tetricus a um austerus asper obscurus tristis.

(Cf. Serv. *Aen.* 7.713; Isid. *Etym.* 10.266; *Gl. Emend.* s.v. *Tetricus*; Papias, s.v. *Tetricus*. The form *Sabinia* and the phrase *unde tetricus ca[a] cum[um]* are peculiar to Arnulfus and Hugutio.)